

NYU POSTDOCTORAL PROGRAM—SPRING 2022

Foundations of Intersubjectivity—An Introduction to the Philosophy that Grounds a New Paradigm in Psychoanalysis

Jack Foehl, Ph.D.
jackfoehl@gmail.com

Many of the themes addressed in contemporary psychoanalytic theory find their origins in the phenomenological “turn” in 20th century continental philosophy. In this seminar we will examine the shift in basic assumptions regarding the nature of being (*ontology*) and knowing (*epistemology*) that led to a number of psychoanalytic innovations in theory and practice.

Each session will include readings from original philosophical texts; secondary readings; and a reading that touches on the relevance of the perspective for psychoanalysis and psychoanalytic work. We will begin by examining Hegel’s formulation of the dialectic of desire in his chapter on “Lordship and Bondage.” This situates intersubjectivity in a *split* of consciousness in order to become a social subject. The examination of this split and the bridging of this split take two paths after Hegel. One path pursues the vagaries of experience, taking us into phenomenology; the second path pursues the vagaries of language, taking us into hermeneutics, the structuralism/poststructuralism of Lacan, and the practical discourse of Habermas and pragmatic philosophy (Pierce, James, Rorty, Wittgenstein).

Given our limited time, we are going to mostly take one fork in this road, looking at intersubjectivity as elaborated by phenomenology. Thus, we move from Hegel to a study of Husserl’s phenomenological reduction. This is a method of research that begins with the radical notion that we can learn most about experience by studying experience itself rather than looking for the causes of experience. This provides a basic *shift in attitude* toward clinical understanding and technique. We will continue by exploring the work of Heidegger, Sartre, and Merleau-Ponty, each who offers a different window into intersubjective experiencing. We end with Gadamer, a hermeneutic philosopher, one representative of a tradition that we might explore later in subsequent seminars.

Throughout, we will look for connections to contemporary thinkers who have, in one way or another, been influenced by this turn of thought. This will include Jessica Benjamin’s work on recognition; the perspectival orientation of early Roy Schafer and Edgar Levenson; Don Stern’s notion of unformulated experience; Irwin Hoffman’s co-construction; and Philip Bromberg’s ideas of multiple self-states and safe surprises. We will consider paths to greater rigor in our psychoanalytic conceptions of intersubjectivity as we think about the philosophy in relation to what we do.

Finally, we will look for tensions between different conceptual polarities: intrapsychic/interpersonal; interpretation/deconstruction; containment/collaboration. Clinical process is welcome to make the connection with our daily work.

This is a deep theory seminar and will entail reading difficult texts. We are meeting for four hours on three Saturdays, each day will include two parts. For each part/thinker, I will give you “cliff notes” to help you through, and we’ll work both to understand the concepts and to locate the clinical application/relevance. Be ready for an exhilarating dive into ideas that ground many contemporary perspectives.

Session 1 (April 23):

Part I: G. W. F. Hegel’s Dialectics of Desire

- 1) Hegel, G. W. F. (1807). Lordship and bondage. In: *Phenomenology of Spirit*. A. V. Miller, tr. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977, pp. 111-119.
- 2) Ogden on Hegel: Excerpts from his writing (pdf compiled by Jack)
- 3) *Recommended:* Hyppolite, J. (1947). Self-consciousness and life. In: *Genesis and Structure of Hegel: Phenomenology of Spirit*. S. Cherniak & J. Heckman, trans. Evanston: Northwestern Universities Press, 1974, pp. 156-177. (selected pages)

Learning Objective: After attending this session, participants will be able to list the specific steps of Hegel’s Master-Slave dialectic

Part II: Edmund Husserl’s Phenomenological Reduction: *The Epoché*

- 1) Husserl, E. (1913). Chapter 1: The positioning which belongs to the natural attitude and its exclusion. In: *Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy, First Book*. F. Kersten, tr. The Hague: Martin Nijhoff Publishers, 1983, pp. 51-62.
- 2) Foehl, J. (2010). The play’s the thing: The primacy of process and the persistence of pluralism in contemporary psychoanalysis. *Contemporary Psychoanalysis*, 46(1), 48-86. **read only pp. 55-64**
- 3) *Recommended:* Zahavi, D. (2003). Intersubjectivity. In: *Husserl’s Phenomenology*. Stanford: Stanford University Press. (pp. 109-125).

Learning Objective: After attending this session, participants will be able to describe the phenomenological reduction.

Session 2 (May 7):

Part I: Martin Heidegger’s *Being-in-the-World*

- 1) Heidegger, M. (1926). Being-in-the-world in general as the basic state of Dasein. In: *Being and Time*. J. Macquarrie & E. Robinson, tr. New York: Harper & Row,

1962, pp. 78-90.

- 2) Heidegger, M. (1926). The existential constitution of the *there*: Being there as State-of-Mind. In: *Being and Time*. J. Macquarrie & E. Robinson, tr. New York: Harper & Row, 1962, pp. 172-182.
- 3) *Recommended*: Burston, D. & Frie, R. (2006). Phenomenology and Human Experience: Scheler, Jaspers and Heidegger (only the section on Heidegger). In: *Psychotherapy as a Human Science*. Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press. pp. 144-161.

Learning Objective: After attending this session, participants will be able to define *Dasein*.

Part II: Jean-Paul Sartre's *Existential Psychoanalysis*

- 1) Sartre, J. P. (1956). The existence of others: The *look*. In *Being and Nothingness*. H. E. Barnes, tr. New York: Philosophical Library, pp. 340-358 (only!).
- 2) Sartre, J. P. (1956). Existential psychoanalysis. In *Being and Nothingness*. H. E. Barnes, tr. New York: Philosophical Library, pp. 557-575.
read only 568-575
- 3) *Recommended*: Cannon, B. (2003). Sartre's contribution to psychoanalysis. In: *Understanding Experience: Psychotherapy and Postmodernism*, R. Frie, ed. London: Routledge, pp. 27-51. (selected pages)

Learning Objective: After attending this session, participants will be able to explain why "Hell is other people."

Session 3 (May 14):

Part I: Maurice Merleau-Ponty's *Lived Body and Intercorporeality*

- 1) Merleau-Ponty, M. (1945). The body as object and mechanistic physiology. In: *The Phenomenology of Perception*. C. Smith, tr. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1962, pp. 73-89. (Look for "phantom limb references" starting on p. 76)
- 2) Abram, D. (1996). Philosophy on the way to ecology. Part I: Maurice Merleau-Ponty and the participatory nature of perception. In: *The Spell of the Sensuous*. New York: Vintage Books, pp. 44-65.

Learning Objective: After attending this session, participants will be able to describe the phantom limb as an experience of world.

Part II: Hans Georg Gadamer's *Hermeneutic Circle*

- 1) Gadamer, H. G. (1966). The universality of the hermeneutic problem. In: *Philosophical Hermeneutics*. D. E. Linge, tr. Berkeley, CA: Univ. of California Press, 1976, pp. 3-17.
- 2) Orange, D. (2010). Hans-Georg Gadamer: Undergoing the situation with the other. In: *Thinking for Clinicians*. New York: Routledge, pp. 99-118.

Learning Objective: After attending this session, participants will be able to describe the hermeneutic circle and its role in dialogue.

Recommended Additional Readings

Session 1: Hegel

- Butler, J. (1987). *Subjects of Desire: Hegelian Reflections in Twentieth-Century France*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Chessick, R. D. (2008). The relevance of Hegel's *Phenomenology of Spirit* to the process of contemporary psychoanalysis. *Journal of the American Academy of Psychoanalysis*, 36: 677-706.
- Kojève, A. (1969). Desire and work in the master slave. In: *Introduction to the Reading of Hegel: Lectures on the Phenomenology of Spirit*. J. Nichols, tr. New York: Basic Books, pp. 39-57.
- O'Neill, J., Ed. (1996). *Hegel's Dialectic of Desire and Recognition: Texts and Commentary*. Albany: State University of New York.
- Williams, R. R. (1992). *Recognition: Fichte and Hegel on the Other*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Williams, R. R. (1997). *Hegel's Ethics of Recognition*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Session 2: Husserl

- Idhe, D. (2012). *Experimental Phenomenology, Second Edition: Multistabilities*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

- Kerrigan, W. (1980). Husserl's Epoché and the genesis of imagination in psychoanalysis. *Psychoanalysis and Contemporary Thought*, 3: 55-83.
- Reis, B. (2011). Reading Kohut through Husserl. *Psychoanalytic Inquiry*, 31: 75-83.
- Ricoeur, P. (1970). The phenomenological approach to the psychoanalytic field. In: *Freud and Philosophy: An Essay on Interpretation*. New Haven: Yale University Press, pp. 375-390.
- Zahavi, D. (2003). *Husserl's Phenomenology*. Stanford: Stanford Univ. Press.
- Zahavi, D. (2008). Self and other. In: *Subjectivity and Selfhood: Investigating the First-Person Perspective*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, pp. 147-177.

Session 3: Heidegger

- Chessick, R. D. (1988). A comparison of the notions of self in the philosophy of Heidegger and the psychoanalytic self psychology of Heinz Kohut. *Psychoanalysis and Contemporary Thought*, 11: 117-144.
- Frie, R. (2013). Heidegger and post-cartesian psychoanalysis: A book discussion of Robert Stolorow's "World, Affectivity, Trauma: Heidegger and Post-Cartesian Psychoanalysis". *International Journal of Psychoanalytic Self Psychology*, 8: 100-110.
- Gendlin, E. T. (1978-79). Befindlichkeit: Heidegger and the philosophy of psychology. *Review of Existential Psychology & Psychiatry*, 16 (1, 2, &3): 43-71.
- Richardson, W. J. (1963). From there to being: Being and time. In: *Heidegger: Through Phenomenology to Thought*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, pp. 27-105.
- Richardson, W. J. (2003). Truth and freedom in psychoanalysis. In: *Understanding Experience: Psychotherapy and Postmodernism*. R. Frie, ed. London: Routledge, pp. 77-99.
- Stolorow, R. D. (2006). Heidegger's investigative method in *Being and Time*. *Psychoanalytic Psychology*, 23: 594-602.

Session 4: Sartre

- Atwood, G. E. (1983). The pursuit of being in the life and thought of Jean-Paul Sartre. *The Psychoanalytic Review*, 70: 143-162.
- Cannon, B. (1991). *Sartre & Psychoanalysis: An Existentialist Challenge to Clinical Metatheory*. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas.
- Frie, R. (1997). Jean-Paul Sartre: Reconstructing the subject. In: *Subjectivity and Intersubjectivity in Modern Philosophy and Psychoanalysis: A Study of Sartre, Binswanger, Lacan and Habermas*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, pp. 65-73.
- Nagel, T. (2010). Sartre: The look and the problem of other minds. In: *Secular Philosophy and the Religious Temperament: Essays 2002-2008*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 163-168.
- Sartre, J. P. (1964). *The Words: Autobiography of Jean-Paul Sartre*. New York: Random House.
- Thompson, G. M. (2001). Is the unconscious really all that unconscious?: The role of being and experience in the psychoanalytic encounter. *Contemporary Psychoanalysis*, 37: 571-612.

Session 5: Merleau-Ponty

- Foehl, J. C. (2014). A phenomenology of depth. *Psychoanalytic Dialogues*, 24: 289-303.
- Hass, L. (2008). *Merleau-Ponty's Philosophy*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Holland, N. J. (2000). In a different ch[i]asm: A feminist rereading of Merleau-Ponty on sexuality. In: *Rereading Merleau-Ponty: Essays beyond the Continental-Analytic Divide*. L. Hass & D. Olkowski, eds. Amherst: Humanity Books, pp. 315-338.
- Hass, L. (2008). *Merleau-Ponty's Philosophy*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Merleau-Ponty, M. (1948). *The World of Perception*. O. Davis, tr. New York: Routledge, 2004.
- Orange, D. (2010). Merleau-Ponty: Embodied subjectivity. In: *Thinking for Clinicians*. New York: Routledge, pp. 55-76.

- Reis, B. (2010). Enactive fields: An approach to interaction in the Kleinian-Bionian model: Commentary on paper by Lawrence J. Brown. *Psychoanalytic Dialogues*, 20: 695-703.

Session 6: Gadamer

- Caputo, J. D. (2000). How to prepare for the coming of the other: Gadamer and Derrida. In: *More Radical Hermeneutics: On Not Knowing Who We Are*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, pp. 41-59.
- Clarke, B. H. (1997). Hermeneutics and the “relational” turn: Schafer, Ricoeur, Gadamer, and the nature of psychoanalytic subjectivity. *Psychoanalysis and Contemporary Thought*, 20: 3-68.
- Gadamer, H. G. (1975). *Truth and Method*. New York: Continuum International Publishing Group, 2011.
- Stern, D. B. (1991). A philosophy for the embedded analyst—Gadamer’s hermeneutics and the social paradigm of psychoanalysis. *Contemporary Psychoanalysis*, 27: 51-80.