

# Comparative Models in Psychoanalytic Theory

## Steven Ellman

The point of the course is to show the overlap between theories and the extent to which these theories rest on theoretical assumptions first put forth by Freud. The attempt in each theory will be to see how these theories fit together and the extent to which certain theoretical and clinical assumptions need to be changed. The overall question will be the extent to which theories can be integrated.

### Week 1

#### **INTRODUCTION**

Freud — And an introduction to the course discussion focusing on epistemological criteria for (psychoanalytic) theory — Freud as a self and object theorist.

### Weeks 2–5

#### **KLEINIAN SELF AND OBJECT THEORISTS**

Melanie Klein  
The Neo-Kleinians

### Weeks 5–6

#### **BRITISH MIDDLE SCHOOL SELF AND OBJECT THEORISTS**

Fairbairn and Guntrip

### Weeks 7–8

#### **KOHUT'S SELF PSYCHOLOGY**

Kohut as a self theorist  
Kohut and Bach — Clinical implications

### Weeks 9–10

#### **WINNICOTT AND LOEWALD**

Winnicott — New theoretical concepts and the fit with Freudian thought  
Winnicott and Loewald — New Freudian Directions

### Weeks 11–14

#### **AMERICAN RELATIONAL THEORISTS**

Greenberg and Mitchell — an introduction to Relational thought  
Mitchell and Mitchell's Loewald  
Ogden, Bion and Reverie — one type of relational thought  
Ogden, Bion and Benjamin — The analytic third

### Week 15

#### **INTEGRATION**

Freud, Contemporary Freudians, Object Relations, and Relational thought.

**READINGS:**  
**All Summary Chapters Will Be Handed out**

- 1) Freud –Summary Chapter covering the- Schreber Case, section 3, The Disposition to Obsessional Neurosis both in S.E. 12 On Narcissism, Instincts and their Vicissitudes, Mourning and Melancholia all in S.E. 14 Ego and The Id sections 2 and 3 S.E. 19
- 2) Klein—Chapter summarizing Klein’s theory until 1945- Read Early Stages of the Oedipus Conflict (1928,9 1), Optional- The Early Development of the Conscience in the Child (1933, 15)
- 3) Read Chapter and \*Mourning and its Relation to Manic-Depressive States (1940, 20) Optional Love, Guilt and Reparation (1937, 19),
- 4) Chapter summarizing Klein from from 1945 until 1960 also read \*Envy and Gratitude (1957,10 2), all other readings optional \*Notes on Some Schizoid Mechanisms (1946-1) On the Theory of Anxiety and Guilt (1948-2 and The origins of Transference (1952-4) and The Mutual Influences in the Development of Ego and Id (1952-5)
- 5) Summary chapter and reading
  - A) Readings are in Melanie Klein Today
    - Volume 1: Mainly Theory
    - Volume 2: Mainly Practice
  - Projective Identification --
    - A) Attacks on linking (Wilfred Bion)
    - B) Contribution to the psychopathology of psychotic states: the importance of projective identification in the ego structure and the object relations of the psychotic patient. (Herbert Rosenfeld)
    - C) Projective identification—some clinical aspects (Betty Joseph)

---

1

The second number signifies the chapter number in Klein's papers entitled Love, Guilt and Reparation & Other Works- 1921-1945 Delacorte Press/Seymour Lawrence

<sup>2</sup> Envy and Gratitude & other Works 1946-1963 Delacorte Press/Seymour Lawrence, is the second set of collected papers of Klein. The number after the year is the chapter number in Envy and Gratitude.

- Part Four: Pathological organizations- read chapter 2, (Meltzer)  
 Chapter 5, (Sohn) and Chapter 6 (O'Shaughnessy)
- D) Developments in technique-  
     Chapters 4 & 5 (Joseph) and Chapter 6 (Malcolm)
- E) A volume to be select by Ron Britton
- 6) Fairbairn, W.D., Summary Chapter on Fairbairn and optional read of chapters in Fairbairn and Guntrip- An Object-Relations Theory of Personality (1952) Basic Books, N.Y.  
 Guntrip, H. Schizoid Phenomena, Object Relations and the Self (1968) IUP—pg. 1-87
- 7) Kohut, H.—Summary Chapter and reading B) other readings optional  
 A) Forms and Transformations of Narcissism, JAPA 1966, 14, 243-272  
 B) The Psychoanalytic Treatment of Narcissistic personality Disorders: Psychoanalytic Study of the Child 1968  
 C) Thoughts on Narcissism and Narcissistic Rage Psychoanalytic Study of the Child 1972  
 D) The Restoration of the Self 1977 IUP New York.
- 8) Continuation of Kohut and read chapters in of one of Bach's Books (to be decided)
- 9) Winnicott, D.W., Summary Chapter optional chapters- The Maturation Processes and the Facilitating Environment, IUP, 1965, N.Y. Chaps. 3-7, 12, 15, 16
- 10) Winnicott, D.W. Playing and Reality, Tavistock Publications, 1971. London . pp.1-64
- 11) Greenberg and Mitchell (1983) Objects Relations and Psychoanalytic Theory—Harvard University Press Chapters 1 and 11 with other chapters optional
- 12) Mitchell, S., (2000) Relationality: From Attachment to Intersubjectivity—Analytic Press Chapters 1-4
- 13) Ogden, T. (1997) Reverie and Interpretation Chapters 2-6
- 14) Aron and Benjamin –A Meeting of Minds and Bonds of Love
- 15) C. Ellman et al (1998) The Modern Freudians (Summary Chapter)